

# THE FIVE-STORY FALL: CORRELATING INDIRECT AND DIRECT EVIDENCE TO EXTEND THE PEDIGREE

Presented by Debbie Mieszala, CG<sup>®</sup>

[Debbie@AdvancingGenealogist.com](mailto:Debbie@AdvancingGenealogist.com)

<http://advancinggenealogist.com/>

©2018–2019

Johanna (Daly) Mahoney plunged to her death taking her parents' and siblings' identities along. Extensive associate analysis and a sixteen-year post-mortem summons led to family.

Difficult research problems have solutions that are not readily found. When direct evidence fails to answer the research question, indirect evidence must be evaluated and correlated. That analysis allows a new framework from which to view the research problem. Even if its value is not apparent, indirect evidence, when correlated with direct evidence, might reveal a solution.

Researching people related to or associated with the subject of study allows patterns to emerge and provides context. Context and patterns reveal a social network and provide a new set of parameters to research within. Facts keep the research and conclusions from going astray.

Maps, gazetteers, plats, deeds, and records that help to visualize locations are useful tools. City maps make obvious the location of the neighborhood church and rural plats define boundaries of the immediate community in which a person lived. These tools add another set of search parameters.

To formulate a conclusion and present a solution that conforms to the Genealogical Proof Standard, one must 1) conduct reasonably exhaustive research, 2) cite all sources 3) analyze and correlate data to test evidence and conclusions, 4) resolve conflicts, and 5) write a well-reasoned conclusion.

The case study presented represents research conducted in records of the United States, England, and Ireland. Data gleaned from records in each location provided clues. The study of associates' names caused patterns to emerge. Those patterns allowed recognition of a new piece of evidence and an invaluable record. A difficult research problem was solved.

### **Microfilm and CD-ROM Resources**

*FamilySearch*. "Manhattan death certificates, 1866–1991." Includes "Certificates, coroners cases," from Health Department of the City of New York, New York, New York Municipal Archives. <https://www.familysearch.org/search/catalog/199051>

McCarthy, Nigel and Anne Quade. *SS. Mary and Joseph Roman Catholic Chapel, Poplar, E. London: Marriages and Baptisms, 1818–1856*. CD-ROM (East of London Family History Society, 2004), extracts. Family History Library, CD-ROM no. 3738, FamilySearch library-use database. <https://familysearch.org/search/catalog/1355192>

New York County, New York, Coroner. "Coroner's Inquisitions, 1823–1898, New York City, New York County, New York." 101 microfilm reels, or view digitized images at a Family History Center. Family History Library, Salt Lake City, Utah. <https://www.familysearch.org/search/catalog/537374>

### **Online Resources**

*Ancestry.com*. <https://search.ancestry.com/>

- "Ireland, Catholic Parish Registers, 1655–1915." Digital images. Citing "Catholic Parish Registers," The National Library of Ireland (NLI), Dublin, Ireland, microfilm. Baptisms, marriages, and deaths. 1,000+ Catholic parishes representing about 94% of parishes. Most records are from 1820s and later. This indexes the registers that are freely available on the National Library of Ireland website. The NLI images are freely linked through Ancestry. <http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=61039>
- "New York, Corporation Plaintiffs, 1824–1911." Index. Referencing Supreme Court records in the New York County Clerk's Office, Division of Old Records. <https://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=5460>
- "New York Emigrant Savings Bank Records, 1850–1883." Database. <https://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=8760>
- "New York Passenger and Crew Lists (including Castle Garden and Ellis Island), 1820–1957." Database and digital images. <https://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=7488>
- Census: 1851 England, 1861 England, 1870 U.S., 1880 U.S.

*The Board for Certification of Genealogists.* <http://www.bcgcertification.org/>

*FamilySearch.org.*

- “New York Probate Records, 1629–1971.” Image browse.  
<https://www.familysearch.org/search/collection/1920234>

*FindMyPast.com.* <https://www.findmypast.com/> Subscription site.

- “The Catholic Heritage Archive.” <https://www.findmypast.com/catholicrecords>
- “Ireland Roman Catholic Parish Baptisms.” <https://search.findmypast.com/search-world-Records/ireland-roman-catholic-parish-baptisms> Free
- “Ireland Roman Catholic Parish Marriages.” <https://search.findmypast.com/search-world-Records/ireland-roman-catholic-parish-marriages> Free
- “Ireland Roman Catholic Parish Burials.” <https://search.findmypast.com/search-world-Records/ireland-roman-catholic-parish-burials>
- “Ireland Roman Catholic Parish Registers Browse.”  
<https://search.findmypast.com/search-world-Records/ireland-roman-catholic-parish-registers-browse>
- “New York Roman Catholic Parish Baptisms.” <https://search.findmypast.com/search-world-Records/new-york-roman-catholic-parish-baptisms>
- “New York Roman Catholic Parish Marriages.” <https://search.findmypast.com/search-world-Records/new-york-roman-catholic-parish-marriages>

*FreeBMD.* Free online access to transcriptions of the civil registration index of births, marriages, and deaths (England and Wales). Incomplete, but the projected date range is 1837–1992.  
<http://www.freebmd.org.uk/>

*GenealogyBank.* <http://genealogybank.com/> : *The New York Times, New York Herald, New York Tribune,* and others.

*Irish Ancestors.* “Roman Catholic Records” section includes record details for Catholic parishes. Interactive maps. <http://www.irishtimes.com/ancestor/browse/counties/remaps/index.htm>

*Irish Genealogy.* <http://www.irishgenealogy.ie/en/> Church and civil records searches. Free.

*Irish Townlands.* <https://www.townlands.ie/en/> Free.

*Logainm.* <http://www.logainm.ie/en/> Irish place names, locate civil parish from the townland.

*National Library of Ireland* (NLI). “Catholic Parish Registers at the NLI.” Images of church registers include baptisms and marriages “... from the majority of Catholic parishes in Ireland and Northern Ireland up to 1880.” <http://registers.nli.ie/> Free.

*New York City Department of Records and Information Services*. “Manhattan 1940s Tax Photos.” <http://nycma.lunaimaging.com/luna/servlet/NYCMA~5~5>

*NYCityMap*. <http://maps.nyc.gov/doitt/nycitymap/>

*New York Public Library, Digital Collections*. <https://digitalcollections.nypl.org/>

- “New York City Directories.” Approximately 1786–1934. <https://digitalcollections.nypl.org/collections/new-york-city-directories#/>
- “Fire Insurance Maps on the Web.” <https://www.nypl.org/collections/nypl-recommendations/guides/fireinsurancemap>

*Old Fulton New York Postcards*. <http://fultonhistory.com/> *The New York Times* and others.

*Ordnance Survey Ireland. GeoHive*. Maps of Ireland with features such as historic layers. <https://geohive.ie/index.html>

*RootsIreland*. Subscription. Roman Catholic parish register extracts. Data extracted from church books (some not filmed) and not the NLI microfilms, so some data is unique. Conversely, the NLI collection might have filmed parishes that *RootsIreland* does not have. <http://rootsireland.ie/>

*TheCore*. “The IreAtlas Townland Database.” Search to learn different relevant jurisdictions covering a specific location in Ireland, including townland, county, barony, parish, poor law union, and province. <http://thecore.com/seanruad/> Free.

*Wikipedia*. “Great Famine (Ireland).” [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Great\\_Famine\\_\(Ireland\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Great_Famine_(Ireland))

### **Suggested Reading and Resources**

Board for Certification of Genealogists. *Genealogy Standards*. 2nd ed. Nashville, Tenn.: Ancestry.com, 2019.

Coughlan, Ronan. *Book of Irish Names*. New York: Sterling Publishing Company, 1989.

DeGrazia, Laura A. “Proof Arguments.” *OnBoard* 15 (January 2009): 1–3. <https://bcgcertification.org/skillbuilding-proof-arguments/>

- Greenwood, Val D. *The Researcher's Guide to American Genealogy*, 4th edition. Baltimore, Maryland: Genealogical Publishing Company, 2017.
- Jones, Thomas W. "The Genealogical Proof Standard: How Simple Can It Be?" *OnBoard* 16 (September 2010):17–18, 20. <https://bcgcertification.org/skillbuilding-the-genealogical-proof-standard-how-simple-can-it-be/>
- Jones, Thomas W. *Mastering Genealogical Proof*. Arlington, Virginia: National Genealogical Society, 2013.
- Little, Barbara Vines. "It's Not That Hard to Write Proof Arguments." *OnBoard* 15 (September 2009): 20–23. <https://bcgcertification.org/skillbuilding-its-not-that-hard-to-write-proof-arguments/>
- Matheson, Robert E. *Varieties and Synonymes of Surnames and Christian Names in Ireland*. Dublin: General Register Office, 1901. Free download on *Internet Archive*.  
<https://archive.org/stream/varietyessynonym00math#page/n5/mode/2up>
- Miller, Kerby A. *Emigrants and Exiles: Ireland and the Irish Exodus to North America*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.
- Mills, Elizabeth Shown. *Evidence Explained: Citing History Sources from Artifacts to Cyberspace*. 3rd edition revised. Baltimore, Maryland: Genealogical Publishing Co., 2017.
- Mills, Elizabeth Shown, editor. *Professional Genealogy: A Manual for Researchers, Writers, Editors, Lecturers, and Librarians*. Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Company, 2001.
- Supreme Court, New York County Clerk, Division of Old Records.
- Szucs, Loretto Dennis and Sandra Hargreaves Luebking, editors. *The Source: A Guidebook to American Genealogy*, Third Edition. Provo, UT: Ancestry, 2006.  
[https://wiki.rootsweb.com/wiki/index.php/The\\_Source:\\_A\\_Guidebook\\_to\\_American\\_Genealogy](https://wiki.rootsweb.com/wiki/index.php/The_Source:_A_Guidebook_to_American_Genealogy)
- Wight, Judith Eccles. *A Rose by Any Other Name: A Guide to Irish Christian Names*. By author. Online at *FamilySearch Books*.  
<https://www.familysearch.org/library/books/records/item/264994-redirect>