

# BEATING THE BUSHES: Finding Jacob Bush's Father

## A Case Study in Correlation of Records Using the GPS

Elissa Scalise Powell, CG<sup>SM</sup>, CGL<sup>SM</sup>

email: Elissa@PowellGenealogy.com

©2017 Elissa Scalise Powell

"Proof is a fundamental concept in genealogy. To merit confidence, each conclusion about an ancestor must have sufficient credibility to be accepted as "proved." Acceptable conclusions, therefore, meet the **Genealogical Proof Standard** (GPS) [which consists of]:

- reasonably exhaustive research;
- complete, accurate source citations to the source or sources of each information item;
- tests—through processes of analysis and correlation—of all sources, ..., and evidence;
- resolution of conflicts among evidence items; and
- a soundly reasoned, coherently written conclusion.

Each element contributes to a conclusion's credibility in a different way, described in the table below, but all the elements are necessary to establish proof."<sup>1</sup>

Element of the GPS	Contribution to Credibility
Reasonably exhaustive research	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Assumes examination of a wide range of high quality sources</li><li>• Minimizes the probability that undiscovered evidence will overturn a too-hasty conclusion</li></ul>
Complete and accurate citation of sources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Demonstrates the extent of the search and the quality of the sources</li><li>• Allows others to replicate the steps taken to reach the conclusion. (Inability to replicate the research casts doubt on the conclusion.)</li></ul>
Testing—through processes of analysis and correlation—of all sources, information items, and evidence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Facilitates sound interpretation of the data contributed by <i>each</i> source</li><li>• Ensures that the conclusion reflects <i>all</i> the evidence</li></ul>
Resolution of conflicting evidence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Substantiates the conclusion's credibility. (If conflicting evidence is not resolved, a credible conclusion is not possible.)</li></ul>
Soundly reasoned, coherently written conclusion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Eliminates the possibility that the conclusion is based on bias, preconception, or inadequate appreciation of the evidence</li><li>• Explains how the evidence led to the conclusion</li></ul>

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.BCGcertification.org/resources/standard.html> downloaded February 2017 with permission.

## Information Analysis

### ORIGIN OF DOCUMENT

- Original source
- Derivative source (abstract, summary, ...)
- Authored narrative

### ACCURACY OF DATA

- Primary information (active participant)
- Secondary information (non-participant)
- Undetermined informant

### RELEVANCE OF INFORMATION

- Direct evidence (directly answers research question)
- Indirect evidence (infers an answer)
- Negative evidence (absence of data is meaningful)

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. [www.BCGcertification.org](http://www.BCGcertification.org) is the website for the Board for Certification of Genealogists, P.O. Box 14291, Washington, D.C. 20044.
2. Board for Certification of Genealogists. *Genealogy Standards*. Nashville, TN: Turner Publishing Co., 2014.
3. Jones, Thomas W. *Mastering Genealogical Proof*. Arlington, VA: National Genealogical Society, 2013.
4. ———. *Mastering Genealogical Documentation*. Arlington, VA: National Genealogical Society, 2017.
5. Merriman, Brenda Dougall. *Genealogical Standards of Evidence: A Guide for Family Historians*. Toronto, Ontario, Canada: Ontario Genealogical Society, 2010.
6. Mills, Elizabeth Shown, ed. *Evidence: A Special Issue of the National Genealogical Society Quarterly*, volume 87, number 3 (September 1999).
7. ———. *Evidence Explained: Citing History Sources from Artifacts to Cyberspace*. 3rd revised edition. Baltimore, MD: Genealogical Publishing Company, 2017.

## THE GOAL

To find Eli Bush's paternal ancestry. It was believed that Eli Bush (1826 – 1912) was a descendant of Daniel Bush (1750 – 1831) of Westmoreland County, Pennsylvania, but the connection between Eli's father Jacob Bush and Daniel Bush could not be found.

## THE BEGINNING

Eli Bush's parents were at first thought to be David and Henrietta Bush. This proved erroneous when the following two pieces of evidence were found which stated that Eli Bush's parents were Jacob Bush and Mary Rimmel. (This false start exemplifies the need for a "reasonably exhaustive search.")

- 1.) Eli's death certificate (not originally provided because the descendant said "both of his parents, Jacob Bush and Mary Rimmel, were born in PA. The death certificate shows no other information about Jacob Bush and Mary Rimmel.")
- 2.) *Memoirs of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, Volume 2* (Madison, WI: Northwestern Historical Association, 1904):253 which states that "His parents were Jacob and Mary (Rimmel) Bush, both natives of Westmoreland County, PA."

Name	<b>Eli Bush</b>	
Birth	5 Feb 1826	Pennsylvania
Death	15 Oct 1912	Washington Twp., Westmoreland Co., PA
Burial		Poke Run Cemetery – Washington Township, Westmoreland County
Occupation	Blacksmith	
Religion	Protestant – Presbyterian Church	
Parents	Jacob Bush	Mary Rimmel
Spouse	Jane Iddings	

A biography of Alpheus Arlington Bush, Eli and Jane Bush's first child, stated that Eli and Jane went to live in Marion County, Ohio, circa 1889. They had returned to Bell Township, Westmoreland County, Pennsylvania by the time the 1900 census was taken. The Marion, Ohio, City Directory for 1890 – 1891 lists Eli Bush, Sr., blacksmith, 121 Grand Avenue. There were no subsequent directory listings for Eli Bush, Sr.

From a previous researcher: "Of course, Eli Bush was of German stock and must have gone over to the Presbyterian Church upon his marriage into the Iddings clan." "Jesse Miller, Jane Iddings Bush's grandfather, donated the land upon which the Poke Run Presbyterian church now stands [in Washington Twp.] - the oldest house of worship in that section of the county."<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> Samuel T. Wiley, *Biographical and Historical Cyclopedia of Westmoreland County, Pennsylvania* (1890; reprint, Laughlintown, PA: Southwest Pennsylvania Genealogical Services, 1980), 717.

## SPOUSE of Eli Bush

Name	<b>Jane Iddings</b>	
Birth	Nov 1825	Pennsylvania
Death	1 June 1904	Salina, Bell Township, Westmoreland County, PA
Burial	12 June 1904	Poke Run Cemetery, Washington Township, Westmoreland County, PA
Religion	Protestant – Presbyterian Church	
Father	William Iddings	
Mother	Anne Miller	
Marriage	circa 1848	Washington Township, Westmoreland County, PA
Children	Alpheus Arlington Bush(1850-)	
	William Idings Bush (1851-)	
	Amanda Jane Bush (1853-)	
	Eli E. Bush (1857-)	
	Anna Mary Bush (1859-1929)	
	Joseph Uriah Bush (1860-)	
	Maggie Caroline Bush (1863-)	
	Martin Elmer Bush (1865- )	
	Elizabeth “Lizzie” Bush (1867-)	

## WAS JACOB THE SON OF DANIEL?

Name	<b>Daniel Bush</b>	
Birth	1750	Budelich, Germany
Death	2 Feb 1836	Westmoreland County, Pennsylvania
Burial		Harrold Cemetery, Westmoreland County

The last will and testament of Daniel Bush, Hempfield Township, Westmoreland County, was made 24 May 1834. His estate was divided in equal shares among his children: Peter, Christian now deceased – to his lawful heirs, Elizabeth now deceased – to her lawful heirs, John, Philip, Susan, Daniel now deceased to his lawful heirs, Andrew, Jacob, Catherina, Margaret and David.

## IF NOT DANIEL, THEN WHO WAS JACOB’S FATHER?

**[Make your notes as the evidence unfolds through the rest of this case study. Can you guess the answer?]**